

PROOF OF HÖLDER-MAÑÉ THEOREM  
(following Robinson, p. 407)

**Theorem.** Let  $X$  be separable Hilbert space,  $A \subset X$  a compact set with finite fractal dimension. Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  be such that  $m > 2d_f(A) + 1$ . Then there exists a bounded linear map  $L : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$  such that  $L|_A$  is injective.

*Proof.* We will show that the set

$$\{L \in \mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m); L|_A \text{ is not injective}\}$$

is first category, hence the set of injective projections is dense by Baire category theorem. Here  $\mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m)$  are bounded, linear maps  $L : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ , i.e. a Banach space with the norm

$$\|L\|_{\mathcal{L}} = \sup \{|Lu|; x \in X, \|x\| \leq 1\}.$$

STEP 1. Set

$$B = \{u - v; u, v \in A\}.$$

It follows that  $B$  is compact and  $d_f(B) \leq 2d_f(A) < m - 1$ . Observe that  $L$  is injective on  $A$  if and only if  $Ly \neq 0$  for any nonzero  $y \in B$ .

STEP 2. Define the sets

$$B_r = \{u \in B; |u| \geq 1/r\}$$

$$B_{r,j,n} = \{u \in B_r; |(e_j, u)| \geq 1/n\}$$

with the indices  $r, j, n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\{e_j\}_j$  is the Hilbert basis of  $X$ . It is easy to verify that

$$\bigcup_r B_r = \bigcup_{r,j,n} B_{r,j,n} = \{u \in B; u \neq 0\}.$$

STEP 3. We further define

$$\mathcal{L}_{r,j,n} = \{L \in \mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m); Lu \neq 0 \text{ for } \forall u \in B_{r,j,n}\}$$

It follows from the above that

$$\begin{aligned} \bigcap_{r,j,n} \mathcal{L}_{r,j,n} &= \{L \in \mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m); Lu \neq 0 \text{ for } \forall u \in \bigcup_{r,j,n} B_{r,j,n}\} \\ &= \{L \in \mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m); Lu \neq 0 \text{ for } \forall u \in B, u \neq 0\} \\ &= \{L \in \mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m); L \text{ is injective on } A\}. \end{aligned}$$

Hence to finish the proof, we need to show that each of the sets  $\mathcal{L}_{r,j,n}$  is open and dense in  $\mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m)$ .

STEP 4. To show that  $\mathcal{L}_{r,j,n}$  is open, fix  $L \in \mathcal{L}_{r,j,n}$ . We first note that  $|Lu| > 0$ , hence  $|Lu| \geq \eta > 0$  on a compact set  $B_{r,j,n}$ . Further, let  $R > 0$  be such that  $|u| \leq R$  for  $\forall u \in B_{r,j,n}$ . We claim that  $\mathcal{L}_{r,j,n}$  contains  $\varepsilon$ -neighborhood of  $L$ , where  $\varepsilon = \eta/2R$ .

Indeed, if  $\|\tilde{L} - L\|_{\mathcal{L}} < \varepsilon$ , then

$$|\tilde{L}u| \geq |Lu| - |(L - \tilde{L})u| \geq \eta - \varepsilon R > \varepsilon/2,$$

for any  $u \in B_{r,j,n}$ , hence  $\tilde{L} \in \mathcal{L}_{r,j,n}$ .

STEP 5. **Key observation:** for given  $L_0 \in \mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m)$  and  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ , there exists  $z \in \mathbb{R}^m$ , with  $|z| = 1$  such that  $L_0u$  is NOT a non-zero multiple of  $z$  for any  $u \in B_r$ . In short

$$\{\lambda z; \lambda \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}\} \cap L_0B_r = \emptyset \quad (1)$$

Geometrically: we can find  $z$  on the unit sphere such that the line passing through  $z$  never intersects  $L_0B_r$  with the exception of the origin. The argument (which we postpone to the next step) is based on the fact that the dimension of  $L_0B_r$  is strictly smaller than the dimension of the unit sphere. Once the key observation is proved, the density of  $\mathcal{L}_{r,j,n}$  follows easily. Given  $L_0$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$ , we define  $L \in \mathcal{L}(X, \mathbb{R}^m)$  by

$$Lu = L_0u + \varepsilon(u, e_j)z.$$

It is clear that  $\|L - L_0\|_{\mathcal{L}} \leq \varepsilon$  and we claim that  $L \in \mathcal{L}_{r,j,n}$ . If not, there exists  $u \in B_{r,j,n}$  such that  $Lu = 0$ , i.e.

$$L_0y = -\varepsilon(u, e_j)z.$$

However,  $(u, e_j) \neq 0$  as  $u \in B_{r,j,n}$ ; this contradicts (1).

STEP 6. It remains to prove the ‘‘key observation’’ from previous step. This is equivalent to showing that

$$\phi(L_0B_r \setminus \{0\}) \neq S_{m-1},$$

where  $S_m$  is the unit sphere

$$S_m = \{z \in \mathbb{R}^m; |z| = 1\}$$

and  $\phi : \mathbb{R}^m \setminus \{0\} \rightarrow S_{m-1}$  is the ‘‘projection’’  $\phi : x \mapsto x/|x|$ .

We set  $M = L_0 B_r \setminus \{0\}$ . Clearly  $d_f(M) \leq d_f(B) < m - 1$ . If  $\phi$  would be Lipschitz (which is “almost true”), we would have  $d_f(\phi(M)) < m - 1$ , hence  $\phi(M)$  cannot equal to  $S_{m-1}$  which has dimension  $m - 1$ .

However,  $\phi$  is not Lipschitz close to the origin, and we have to elaborate here a bit. We set

$$M_k = \{x \in M; |x| \geq 1/k\}.$$

Clearly  $\phi(M) = \phi(\cup_k M_k) = \cup_k \phi(M_k)$ . Now  $\phi$  is Lipschitz on  $M_k$ , and  $M_k$  is compact. Hence  $\phi(M_k)$  is compact subset of  $S_{m-1}$  with  $d_f(\phi(M_k)) < m - 1$ . It follows that  $\phi(M_k)$  has empty interior (with respect to  $S_{m-1}$ ); hence  $\phi(M) = \cup_k \phi(M_k)$  cannot fill  $S_m$  by Baire category theorem.

**Remark.** The end of the proof can be simplified, using the properties of Hausdorff dimension  $d_h$ .

Indeed,  $d_h(\phi(M_k)) \leq d_f(\phi(M_k)) \leq d_f(M)$ . Hence, as  $d_h$  is countably subadditive (unlike  $d_f$ ),

$$d_h(\phi(M)) = \sup_k d_h(\phi(M_k)) \leq d_f(M) < m - 1.$$

Hence  $\phi(M) \neq S_{m-1}$  as required.